

UNIVERSITY OF MACAU

Faculty of Law

Remedies in WTO Dispute Settlement Mechanism: A Study of Scope, Ambit, Effectiveness of the Mechanism and the Proposals for Future Reform *

Thesis presented to the
Faculty of Law,
University of Macau for
the granting of the
Master of International
Law

Tao Yang
M-A3-6129-1

Supervisor: Prof. Muruga
Perumal

30/08/2005

* The opinions expressed are strictly personal. All errors, of course, remain mine.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Preface and Acknowledgement	Page
CHAPTER 1	General Introduction	
1.1	Introduction to the Topic	9
1.2	Research	13
	Questions.....	15
1.3	Methodology.....	16
1.4	Limitation of the Study.....	17
CHAPTER 2	Legal Backgrounds	17
2.1	The ITO, the GATT, and the WTO.....	20
2.1.1	Overview the History.....	22
2.1.2	The Dispute Settlement Body.....	22
2.1.3	The Dispute Settlement Understanding.....	22
2.2	Reports of Panels and the Appellate Body.....	
2.2.1	The Effect of Reports to the Parties to the Particular Dispute.....	26
2.2.2	The Precedent of Reports of Prior Panels and the Appellate	30
	Body.....	32
2.3	Summary.....	32
		33
CHAPTER 3	Remedies and the Law	35
3.1	Remedies in Public Law and Private Law.....	36
3.1.1	Distributive Justice and Corrective Justice.....	36
3.1.2	Vague in Public Law and Specific in Private Law.....	
3.1.3	Prospective in Public Law and Retrospective in Private Law.....	40
3.2	Remedies in Public International Law.....	41
3.2.1	Introduction.....	41
3.2.2	The Relevance of Public International Law for WTO Law on Remedies	46
3.2.3	The Primary and Secondary Obligations in ILC Draft.....	47
3.2.4	Cessation and non-repetition.....	
3.2.5	Reparation.....	48
		48
3.2.6	Countermeasures.....	51
		55
3.2.7	The Function of Remedies in the ILC Draft.....	55
3.3	Summary.....	57
CHAPTER 4	Negotiation on Remedies Reforms	
4.1	Negotiation in GATT times.....	59
4.1.1	Full Picture of the Legal Enforcement under GATT.....	
4.1.2	The History of Adoption of the DSU.....	

4.2	Negotiation in WTO.....
4.2.1	Overview the History of Reform Negotiations.....
4.2.2	Standpoints for Changes by Developing Countries.....
4.2.3	European Normative Approach and American Transactional Approach.....

			Pag e
4.3	Summary.....		
CHAPTER 5	Remedies in GATT and WTO		62
5.1	Remedial Action under GATT Law.....		64
5.1.1	The “usual” Remedies under GATT Law.....		65
5.1.2	The “unusual” Deviations of Remedies under GATT.....		66
5.2	Remedies Action under WTO Law.....		67
5.2.1	The “usual” Remedies under WTO Law.....		73
5.2.2	The “unusual” Deviation of Remedies under WTO.....		75
5.2.3	Legal Nature of the WTO Law-the Consequences of Breach.....		79
5.2.4	The Purpose of WTO Remedies.....		86
5.3	What the Future may Hold and Its Limitations.....		
CHAPTER 6	The Effective Way to Utilize Remedies Under the WTO DSM, China’s Proposal for the Reform of Remedies and China’s CEPA		96
6.1	Measures under the DSM-Treaty Interpretation.....		
6.1.1	The Relevance of Treaty Interpretation to the Utilization of Remedies under the WTO DSM.....		97
6.1.2	Introduction to the Treaty Interpretation in the WTO.....		104
6.1.3	The Vienna Convention on the law of Treaties.....		
6.1.4	General Principles Not Expressly Mentioned in the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties.....		110
6.2	Measures out of the DSM.....		117
6.2.1	Reform Negotiation and China’s Proposal.....		123
6.2.2	RTAs and China’s CEPA.....		
CHAPTER 7	Conclusion		135
APPENDIX 1	Dispute With Uncertainty As to the Outcome.....		137
APPENDIX 2	Article31, 32 of Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties.....		138
BIBLIOGRAPHY			